

ENVIRONMENT AND REGENERATION SCRUTINY COMMITTEE

Minutes of a meeting held on 19th November, 2019.

Present: Councillor Ms. B.E. Brooks (Chairman); Councillor Ms. S. Sivagnanam (Vice-Chairman); Councillors V.J. Bailey, Mrs. P. Drake, V.P. Driscoll, G. John, M.J.G. Morgan and A.R. Robertson.

453 APOLOGIES FOR ABSENCE –

These were received from Councillors L.O. Rowlands and S.T. Wiliam.

454 MINUTES –

RECOMMENDED – T H A T the minutes of the meeting held on 16th October, 2019 be approved as a correct record.

455 DECLARATIONS OF INTEREST –

No declarations were received.

456 PRESENTATION – COASTAL MONITORING ANNUAL UPDATE – CLIVE MOON (ENGINEERING MANAGER – ENVIRONMENT) –

The Engineering Manager – Environment provided a presentation on coastal monitoring which included the impact on climate change. In addition, the presentation included an overview of the work of the Wales Coastal Monitoring Centre and recent monitoring undertaken in the Vale along with an update on future work.

The Engineering Manager began by stating that monitoring was important because the Vale of Glamorgan had 45 kms of coastline and 4 kms of coastal defences. There were approximately 100 properties which were at risk to tidal flooding or coastal erosion. The land at risk had a property value of £15.8 million. In addition, there were potential risks to critical infrastructure such as Aberthaw Power Station and Barry Sewage Pumping Station, and monitoring was also important in terms of tourism and recreation.

In terms of U.K. wide predictions on climate change, a U.K.C.P.18 Marine Report published in November 2018 highlighted that under all climate change scenarios U.K. coastal flood risk was expected to increase over the 21st Century and beyond. In addition, it was projected that there would be an increase in frequency and magnitude of extreme water levels along with an increase in future flood risks which would be dominated by the effects of time – mean sea level rises.

Of the 4 U.K. capital cities, London and Cardiff showed the largest predicted rise in sea levels. At present, the most likely scenario for Cardiff was a 1 metre rise in sea level but it was recognised that this could be lower. Even if the rise in sea level was only 100 mms then this would still have a significant impact. Other assumptions also included the reduction in the ice sheets which would also contribute to a rise in sea levels. It was also important to note that current projections went up to the year 2300 and these indicated a 4 metre rise in sea levels which was very significant and would have a major impact particularly on London and Cardiff. At a local level, monitoring had shown, that since the 19th Century, sea levels had risen by around 160 mms. Future predictions were now based in metres.

The Engineering Manager then referred to the role of the Wales Coastal Monitoring Centre hosted by the Vale of Glamorgan in partnership with Gwynedd Council, Conwy County Borough Council and the Welsh Local Government Association. The purpose of this was to develop a strategic approach to coastal monitoring of Wales, supporting the national strategy for flood and coastal erosion risk management, through delivery of the evidence base required for risk based decision making. The Monitoring Centre was currently in its second year of a three year funding allocation. The Monitoring Centre would monitor areas at high risk of tidal floods which would rank where high risk assets were located. There was currently a lot of monitoring being undertaken in North Wales with local monitoring in the Vale of Glamorgan concentrated in Penarth, Cwm Colhugh and Barry. Monitoring activity was based on surveys being undertaken by officers through the use of Global Positioning System kits which were used to monitor sea levels. Recent surveys that had been undertaken included the Knap in Barry and Forest Road in Penarth. In terms of cliff falls in Penarth, a laser scanner would be used to create a 3D model and this way of monitoring was quicker than a physical survey undertaken by an officer.

With regards to future monitoring aims, this included the following:

- establish a consistent and routine monitoring regime around the coastline
- inform risk based approach to managing coastal interests
- continued support for the Wales Coastal Monitoring Centre
- collaboration with Academia (Cardiff University).

A Committee Member queried when monitoring began and whether sea levels were increasing. In reply, the Engineering Manager stated that monitoring of the sea levels around Newport began during the 1990s while monitoring of Newlyn began in the 1900s. Over recent years, a lot of the data had been digitised and satellites were now used to measure sea levels. This was an ongoing process and there was a clear track that showed that levels were going up. One new aspect that had been factored in was thermal expansion which meant that a rise in sea temperatures could also lead to an increase in sea levels. The picture nationally was further complicated by the compression of land following the last ice age.

In reply to a query as to whether the level of rain affected river flood risk, the Engineering Manager stated that river flooding was not related to the rise in sea

levels, although warmer summers would lead to heavier rain falls. In some areas of the Vale, the capacity of rivers to hold water was limited and this was being affected by global warming. The main risk related to the unlikely event of the 1:1000 chance of a critical storm and a 1:1000 chance of a rise in sea levels occurring at the same time. On a national basis, the Engineering Manager stated that there was more cause for concern around river flooding and this needed to be managed through the planning process in order to ensure there was adequate drainage for water and that new homes were not built on areas prone to flooding. This was also the most likely risk in the Vale but it was hard to predict the impact of new roads, curbs and paved areas. As flooding was likely to be more frequent, the Council needed to raise local awareness that flooding could occur at some point, the likelihood of which would be increased due to climate change.

In response to a query as to whether the modelling took into account the compression of land that had been taking place since the last ice age, the Engineering Manager stated that the U.K.C.P.18 Marine Report contained a number of authors and sources. There was an appreciation that changes had been going on for thousands of years, but these were also cyclical. There was a lot of uncertainty which would also depend on how humans reacted.

A Committee Member queried whether the Vale of Glamorgan Council had a responsibility to maintain paths on private land that were at risk to cliff erosion. In reply, the Engineering Manager stated that the Council had a responsibility for the Wales Coastal Path, but the Council did not have an obligation unless the route was an adopted highway. For private land, there was no obligation for the Council to assist unless it was in the public interest.

Having considered the presentation, it was

RECOMMENDED – T H A T the Coastal Monitoring Update be noted.

Reason for recommendation

Having noted the work being undertaken around coastal monitoring.

457 SECTION 106 OFF-SITE AFFORDABLE HOUSING CONTRIBUTIONS (REF) –

Cabinet, on 4th November, 2019 had authorised proposals around allocating Section 106 off-site affordable housing contributions.

Cabinet had authorised an amendment to the Council's adopted Section 106 Protocol for Implementation (Appendix C), specifically in relation to Section 106 contributions received from developers to provide off-site affordable housing.

The adopted Local Development Plan 2011-2026 (LDP) required new residential developments, where viable, to provide affordable housing on-site. It was only when exceptional circumstances had been demonstrated that an off-site financial contribution had been considered and agreed, such as insurmountable

development viability issues caused or exacerbated by the affordable housing requirements; or site specific circumstances which would make affordable housing delivery and/or management extremely difficult.

The Council currently held £5,893,961.94 for the delivery of affordable housing in the Vale of Glamorgan. These off-site contributions had been secured from numerous development sites across the Vale of Glamorgan due to various circumstances.

It was reported that delivery of affordable housing using these contributions could be challenging for a number of reasons, including land availability, which justified a different approach than other section 106 contributions which could generally be spent quickly in the area where the development occurred.

Cabinet had therefore authorised the introduction of a new two-stage approach for considering these Section 106 off-site affordable housing contributions, to allow for contributions to be considered strategically, as well as locally.

A Committee Member referred to the amount of approximately £6 million allocated to build new affordable housing. The Member queried how many houses could be built with this amount. In reply, the Head of Regeneration and Planning stated that using an approximation of £150,000 per house, then that would be around 40. It was important to recognise that in addition to the £6 million, the Council could also utilise the Housing Revenue Account. Furthermore, the Managing Director stated that the contributions represented a suite of measures that could assist in attracting future developers. In addition, Welsh Government funding was also available, and this partnership approach had more advantages than if the Council tried to develop its own schemes.

In relation to £1 million allocated for Dinas Powys, a Committee Member stated that he would be keen for this money to be spent in Dinas Powys. In reply, the Head of Regeneration and Planning stated that in the most part this money would be spent in Dinas Powys but such an approach was not always the most effective. He added that some Wards had low levels of development, and so, the Council tried to spend the money in those Wards to attract developers. In addition, there would be situations where the contribution was so large that the Council could not spend the entire money in those Wards. It was also important to recognise that the contribution was 'time limited' and there was a challenge in making use of the money and not lose it.

Subsequently, it was

RECOMMENDED – T H A T the proposals and recommendations approved by Cabinet in relation to Section 106 Off-Site Affordable Housing Contributions made at its meeting held on 4th November, 2019 be endorsed.

Reason for recommendation

To endorse the proposals and recommendations contained within the report.

458 DRAFT VALE OF GLAMORGAN COUNCIL CORPORATE PLAN 2020-25
(REF) –

The Managing Director presented the reference from Cabinet and advised that on 21st October, 2019 Cabinet had approved the Council's new draft Corporate Plan for 2020-25. The Corporate Plan had been referred to all Scrutiny Committees as part of the consultation process.

In developing the draft Corporate Plan, the Council had undertaken extensive engagement and considered a range of information and data to inform the development of the Plan. This included:

- The Public Opinion Survey
- Big Conversation with Staff
- Performance data
- Key Population data for the Vale
- Consideration by Scrutiny Committee (Corporate Performance and Resources)
- Partnership activities and priorities
- Stakeholder workshop
- Discussions with the Vale 50+ Strategy Forum
- Corporate Risks
- Budget consultation
- Discussions at Community Liaison Committee and Voluntary Sector Joint Liaison Committee.

The development of the draft plan also reflected the significant change in the organisation since the publication of the current plan. This had involved working in a more integrated, outcome-focused way, increased partnership work, a changing legislative environment and a greater focus on involving staff and the public in the design and delivery of services.

In developing the Corporate Plan and priorities for the next five years, the Council had considered:

- what our residents have told us
- our knowledge and understanding of the local area and the local community
- our statutory duties
- the resources available to us
- best practice and what we know works locally
- the views of our partners
- commitments we have made to deliver with our partners e.g. the Public Services Board Well-being Plan
- our achievements in delivering the previous Corporate Plan
- advice and support from the Future Generations, Welsh Language, Children's, Older People, and Equalities and Human Rights Commissioners
- advice and recommendations from our regulators and inspectors.

One of the central aspects of the current Plan was the reframing of the Council's vision and values. These had been tested during the engagement process and were considered to remain relevant. The draft Plan therefore set out how the vision and values would guide the delivery of the new well-being objectives and actions.

The plan set out the proposed new well-being objectives which were:

- To work with and for our communities
- To support learning, employment and sustainable economic growth
- To support people at home and in their community
- To respect, enhance and enjoy our environment.

In developing the draft Plan, it was proposed that in response to feedback received that a new approach to corporate planning be adopted by producing an Annual Delivery Plan to accompany the overarching five-year plan.

The more detailed Annual Delivery Plan would be published each Spring and detailed the key activities that would be undertaken to deliver on the commitments in the Corporate Plan. This would directly inform individual Service Plans which were also produced annually and contained annual performance measures and targets.

The Council had a robust and well-respected performance management framework. The Leader with Cabinet and the Corporate Management Team would continue to monitor performance and ensure progress against the four objectives. The Council's Scrutiny Committees would regularly scrutinise performance to ensure that the Council was delivering its vision and the necessary outcomes to improve local well-being.

Proposals relating to the performance management arrangements, including the approach to the Annual Delivery Plan, would be developed in the coming months with engagement being undertaken with Elected Members and senior officers.

A Committee Member referred to the objective relating to communication, and he stated that there needed to be better communication between the Highways Department and Local Ward Members, particularly around road works and road closures. The Member referred to coordination of works on roads around Llantwit Major, and the impact that this had on road users. In reply, the Managing Director stated that there had been a lot of works ongoing for 18 months, with new roads and works all being undertaken at the same time in and around a busy corridor. The Managing Director agreed that as this was a difficult area to manage, and when a road was to be closed, then the Council should engage more closely with the Local Ward Member. An example of this was works underway at the Weycock Cross roundabout, which had been moved to night time in order to avoid traffic disruption.

In referring to the four new Wellbeing Objectives, a Committee Member stated that these were fairly basic and stated that these would be something that any

organisation would be undertaking on a daily basis. In reply, the Managing Director stated that the Objectives were deliberately worded that way as these were things that the Council should be focused upon. Objection One for example, was how the Council treated people and the techniques used around customer service. He stated that these were things the Council already did but the Council needed to do these better. The use of less specific proposals was deliberate as the Council had moved away from a 'to do' list and was thinking more strategic.

Further to this point, a Committee Member queried how implementation of the objectives would be evaluated and the Member queried whether the new Plan would be easy for the public to understand. In reply, the Managing Director stated that there was a fine line, and that Service Plans would have specific actions outlining how the objectives would be achieved. The Managing Director stated that it was accepted that it may be a little bit more difficult for the public to find the actions, but as this was the drafting stage it was important to carry out engagement.

The Chairman stated that it would be important to feed back that the Plan needed to be in language that people could understand and clearly showed how the objectives would be met. In reply, the Managing Director stated that the example he liked to use was in relation to Active Lifestyles which was directly linked to Housing Adaptations. There were lots of examples that would be included within the Annual Delivery Plan which would contain more detail and include a lot of examples of integrated working. This would ensure that services no longer worked on their own and that their priorities linked to the Preventative Agenda.

There was a consensus among the Committee that it would be useful for the Corporate Plan to be more prescriptive and for the document to be easily accessible for the public. Therefore, the wording of the Corporate Plan needed to be considered with an emphasis on it being clear and easy to understand with less use of corporate language. This would be fed back.

Subsequently, it was

RECOMMENDED – T H A T the draft Corporate Plan attached at Appendix A to the Cabinet Report be endorsed.

Reasons for recommendations

Following consideration of the draft Corporate Plan for 2020-25.

459 REVENUE AND CAPITAL MONITORING FOR THE PERIOD 1ST APRIL 2019 TO 31ST AUGUST 2019 (DEH) –

The Principal Accountant presented the report which advised of progress in relation to revenue and capital expenditure for the period 1st April to 31st August, 2019.

The service was anticipating an adverse variance by year end and would not achieve its savings target in full this year

Directorate/Service	2019/20	2019/20	Variance
	Original Budget	Projected	(+)Favourable (-) Adverse
	£000	£000	£000
Neighbourhood & Transport Services	25,443	26,963	(1,520)
Unplanned use of reserves to fund overspend	0	(1,520)	+1,520
Building Services	0	0	0
Regeneration	2,057	2,057	0
Development Management	967	967	0
Total	28,467	28,467	0

Neighbourhood Services and Transport - This service was currently projecting to have an adverse variance of £1.520m against the 2019/20 budget. The savings target for 2019/20 was £932,000. Plans for saving this amount were underway and being continually monitored however several of the proposed savings had a long lead in time therefore it was currently projected that only around half of the savings would be found in 2019/20. The anticipated shortfall of £470,000 would be funded via the Neighbourhood Services Reserve.

Within the Waste Collection Service it was anticipated that there would be an adverse variance of around £650,000. There was still pressure on employee and transport budgets due to downtime involved in travelling to Cardiff to dispose of waste. Cowbridge was currently being used as a temporary transfer station for elements of recycling material with the aim of reducing this downtime, however, additional resource was still being utilised. The planned future service changes to the waste collection service were likely to require further resource in the initial period of service change. There was also pressure on the budget due to the high price currently being paid to treat the co-mingled recycling. The price had increased steadily over the last couple of years since China banned elements of recycling such as plastic into the country. This had been compounded by a high percent of dry recycling collected since May 2019 being rejected by the new contractor. The rejected material had to be sent for more expensive treatment or landfill which had cost an additional £150,000 from May to August 2019. Changes had been made to the collection process with the aim of ensuring the correct containers were placed on the kerbside for dry recycling therefore it was anticipated that considerably less recycling would be rejected going forward. Preparations were ongoing to enable the rollout of a kerbside sort method of recycling. It was anticipated that this would reduce the costs currently being spent on treating recycling however the rollout would be phased from around Autumn 2019 therefore the full benefit would not be achieved in 2019/20.

There was also currently a pressure of around £100,000 on the staffing budget at Barry Island. Due to the popularity of the resort additional resources had been

utilised to maintain the expected cleanliness standards of the beach and promenade.

In addition there was a projected adverse variance against the street lighting energy budget. Although efforts had been made over previous years to turn a high percentage of street lighting to LED there had been significant increases to the cost of energy. The cost had increased by 13% in 2018/19 and now a further 9.5% in 2019/20. There was therefore a projected adverse variance of £150,000 against this budget.

The Directorate was being requested to look at ways of mitigating a projected overspend however, it was anticipated that reserves would have to be utilised to balance this budget in the current financial year.

Regeneration - This budget covered the Countryside, Economic Development and Tourism and Events functions. Although the forecast was again shown as a balanced budget at year-end, there remained concern over the long-established income targets for car parking charges and commercial opportunities within the Countryside Division, as these historic savings targets would be difficult to achieve this year if charges were not implemented. Efforts would once again be made to achieve a balanced budget at year-end, but the situation would be closely monitored.

Development Management - Fee income remained on track to achieve its target as a number of major applications had been received to date. Staff movement and short term vacancies whilst the recruitment process took place had resulted in an under spend on staff costs. In addition, the Division was also continuing to pursue the use of Planning Performance Agreements and other streams of income generation such as pre-planning application advice to help support the regulatory process, in line with 2019/20 savings targets.

2019/20 Savings Targets

As part of the Final Revenue Budget Proposals for 2019/20, a savings target of £1.076m was set for this Committee. The £600,000 Reshaping Services savings target, set for Neighbourhood Services, had now been allocated into specific projects. A target of £32,000 has been set for Single Use Sports Facilities and this project was being reported via the Healthy Living and Social Care Scrutiny Committee. This therefore now brought the total savings target for this Committee to £1.044m. Attached at Appendix 1 was a statement detailing all savings targets for 2019/20. Neighbourhood Services and Transport were projecting that they would achieve around half of their saving target. Updates on progress would be provided to Members during the year.

Capital

Appendix 2 detailed financial progress on the Capital Programme as at 31st August, 2019. The following changes had been made to the Capital Programme since the last report to Committee.

Ogmore by Sea/St. Brides Major Sustainable Transport Improvements - Delegated authority had been used to increase this capital scheme by £50,000 using sustainable transport S106 contributions received from the developers at Ogmore Residential Centre and Ogmore by Sea Caravan Park. This scheme comprised numerous sustainable transport schemes throughout Ogmore by Sea and St. Brides Major to improve infrastructure for pedestrians.

Local Transport Fund - The Council has been awarded a £85,000 Welsh Government grant via Merthyr Tydfil Council for 2019/20. The grant had been awarded in relation to the Barry Docks Interchange and must be fully spent by 31st March 2020. It had been requested that the 2019/20 Capital Programme be increased by £85,000.

Improve Pedestrian Movement along Treharne Road - As part of this budget, £20,000 had been allocated to provide the Vale Adaptive Cycling Club with 3 specialist adaptive cycles: Electric Duet Wheelchair Tandem Cycle, Electric Side X Side Tandem Cycle and Tomcat Special Needs Bullet Trike, to meet the needs of their beneficiaries. However, the club had now been awarded a Strong Communities grant to fund this equipment. It had therefore been requested that the 2019/20 budget is reduced by £20,000. The remaining £120,000 of this budget would be spent on footway and public transport infrastructure improvements in the area around the former Maes Dyfan School.

Maendy Pedestrian Sustainable Transport Improvements - It had been requested that this scheme was renamed 'Ystradowen Sustainable Transport Improvements' as a result of land ownership issues.

Welsh Water Bonvilston Improvements - Delegated authority had been used to increase the 2019/20 Capital Programme by £1.049m to pay Welsh Water Dwr Cymru to undertake reinforcement works in Bonvilston. These works were to be funded from s106 monies.

Economic Stimulus within Local Authorities - The Council had been awarded a £769,000 grant from Welsh Government to invest in capital schemes to drive important changes in communities. The schemes must provide economic benefits which were aligned with the Welsh Government's priorities. Meetings were being arranged to discuss the allocation of this funding. It had been requested that the 2019/20 Capital Programme was increased by £769,000.

Hood Road Goods Shed Land Payment - The Council was in a legal joint venture (JV) with the Welsh Government relating to land at the Innovation Quarter. In accordance with the JV any income generated from the sale of land was split between the two parties based on a percentage ratio, which was determined by the level of development expenditure both parties had invested to date into the Innovation Quarter. It had therefore been requested that the 2019/20 capital programme was increased by £62.37k to allow a payment to be made to Welsh Government for their part of a capital receipt received by the Council.

High Street/Broad Street Traffic Management - This scheme was complete, and it had therefore been requested that the remaining £13,000 budget was removed from the capital programme.

Having considered the report, it was

RECOMMENDED – T H A T the position with regard to the 2019/20 Revenue and Capital Budgets be noted.

Reason for recommendation

Following consideration of the position with regard to the 2019/20 Revenue and Capital Budgets.

460 QUARTER 1 2019-20 PERFORMANCE REPORT: AN ENVIRONMENTALLY RESPONSIBLE AND PROSPEROUS VALE (MD) –

The Managing Director presented the report which outlined the Quarter 1 performance results for the period 1st April, 2019 to 30th June, 2019, with the Corporate Plan Wellbeing Outcome 2 – An Environmentally Responsible and Prosperous Vale.

The performance report presented the progress at Quarter 1 (1st April to 30th June, 2019) towards achieving the Corporate Plan Well-being Outcomes for year 4 of the Corporate Plan 2016-20 as aligned to Well-being Outcome 2, 'An Environmentally Responsible and Prosperous Vale'.

Overall, good progress had been made in delivering the Corporate Plan in relation to the Well-being Outcome 2 objectives of, 'Promoting regeneration, economic growth and employment' and 'Promoting sustainable development and protecting our environment'. This had contributed to an overall GREEN status for the Outcome at Quarter 1 (Q1).

94% (79/84) of planned actions aligned to 'An Environmentally Responsible and Prosperous Vale' had been attributed a Green performance status reflecting the exceptional progress made during the Quarter. 1% (1/84) of actions were attributed an Amber status and 5% (4/84) had been attributed a Red status.

In relation to the programme to replace LED lights in Penarth, the Committee was advised that 67% of fixtures had been converted with it being projected that 91% would be completed by the end of the year. This would result in a reduction of 650 tonnes of carbon.

Subsequently, it was

RECOMMENDED –

(1) T H A T the performance results and progress towards achieving key outcomes in line with the Council's Year 4 priorities for the Corporate Plan

Wellbeing Outcome 2 – The Vale of Glamorgan had a strong and sustainable economy and the local environment is safeguarded for present and future generations, be noted.

(2) T H A T the remedial actions taken to address areas of underperformance and to tackle the key challenges identified be noted.

Reasons for recommendations

(1) To ensure that the Council clearly demonstrates the progress being made towards achieving its Corporate Plan Wellbeing Outcomes in making a positive difference to the lives of Vale of Glamorgan citizens.

(2) To ensure the Council is effectively assessing its performance in line with the requirement to secure continuous improvement as outlined in the Local Government Measure (Wales) 2009 and reflecting the requirements of the Wellbeing and Future Generations (Wales) Act 2015 that it maximises its contribution to achieving the wellbeing goals for Wales.

461 2ND QUARTER SCRUTINY DECISION TRACKING OF
RECOMMENDATIONS AND UPDATED WORK PROGRAMME SCHEDULE
2019/20 (MD) –

The Democratic and Scrutiny Services Officer advised Members of progress in relation to the Scrutiny Committee's recommendations and confirmed the updated Work Programme schedule for 2019/20.

In relation to Appendix A and a site visit to the Cowbridge Waste Transfer facility, Members noted that a visit had been arranged for 14th November, 2019 but this had been cancelled due to adverse weather. Therefore, a future date would be arranged in the New Year.

The Committee queried the call for an Environment Impact Assessment for the Biomass Plant in Barry. The Managing Director confirmed that an update from Welsh Government would be provided.

Subsequently, it was

RECOMMENDED –

(1) T H A T the updated work programme schedule attached at Appendix D to the report be uploaded to the Council's website.

(2) T H A T the following recommendations be deemed completed:

23 July 2019	
Min. No. 184 – Highway Resurfacing Three Year Plan 2019-2022 (REF) – Recommended	
(2) That a report be provided detailing the impact on the road network following severe adverse weather over a period of several years.	Added to work programme schedule. Completed
24 September 2019	
Min. No. 330 – Annual Corporate Safeguarding Report – 2018/19 (REF) – Recommended	
That the Annual Corporate Safeguarding Report for 2018/19 be deferred to the October Committee meeting	Report emailed to Members for information. Completed
Min. No. 331 – Wellbeing of Future Generations: An Examination of the Programme of Regeneration at Barry and Barry Island – Vale of Glamorgan Council (July 2019) (DEH) – Recommended	
(2) That the report be referred to Cabinet for its consideration.	Referred to Cabinet meeting on 4 th November, 2019, which noted the key outcomes to emerge. (Min. No. C136 refers) Completed
4 April 2019	
Min. No. 915 – Public Spaces Protection Orders – Dog Controls (REF) – Recommended	
(1) That Cabinet be asked to consider how the Council can carry out consultation and engagement in a better way.	Cabinet, at its meeting on 17 th June, 2019, resolved [1] That the comments of the Scrutiny Committee in relation to better engagement with members of the public be accepted. [2] That Cabinet recommends to Council that the introduction of Public Spaces Protection Orders – Dog Controls, be approved. (Min. No. C5 refers) Completed
(2) That the Committee receive an update report in 12 months' time on the effectiveness of Dog Control Orders, which also included an assessment of assets (including receptacles), and with an analysis of where issues occurred and possible solutions.	Added to work programme schedule. Completed
Min. No. 916 – Barry Town Centre Summit (REF) – Recommended	
(1) That Cabinet agree to the setting up of a working group, to include representatives of the Vale Council,	Cabinet, at its meeting on 17 th June, 2019, resolved

Barry Town Council, Traders and other local interested parties, in order to agree town centre improvement priorities and to progress actions.	[1] That the comments of the Scrutiny Committee be noted. [2] That the request for the creation of a working group, to include representatives of the Vale Council, Barry Town Council, Traders and other interest parties, be noted and taken into account during the process to renew the Council's Corporate Plan and Town Centre Framework. (Min. No. C4 refers) Completed
(2) That the Committee receives a report regarding funding models open to the Council for investment.	Added to work programme schedule. Completed
Min. No. 917 – Proposed Parking Management Policy 2019/20 (REF) – Recommended	
Town Centre Car Parking –	
(1) That Cabinet be advised that the Committee does not support town centre charges for parking.	Referred to Cabinet meeting on 1 st July, 2019. Cabinet, having considered the reference and recommendations of both the Environment and Regeneration Scrutiny Committee and the Corporate Performance and Resources Scrutiny Committee RESOLVED – THAT the reports be noted and fed into a comprehensive and indepth review of these matters. (Min. No. C25 refers) Completed
(2) That Cabinet be advised that prior to any formal discussions with Llantwit Major Town Council about the possible transfer of car parking assets, that these car parks are to be brought up to a good quality of standard by the Vale of Glamorgan Council.	
(3) That Cabinet agree to the principle that turnover can be improved without recourse to charging for parking through free parking and better enforcement.	
(4) That Cabinet recognise the inequality that exists in the report from some Council staff being required to pay for parking while other Council staff would be exempt from paying to park at their place of work, and give consideration to introducing parking charges on site at Council offices should charging go ahead.	
Resort/Coastal Car Parks –	
(5) That Cabinet be advised of the Committee's view that there should not be any charges for parking at the coastal parks at Barry (Cold Knap and Bron y Mor), Llantwit Major (Cwm Colhuw) and Penarth (Cliff Walk).	Referred to Cabinet meeting on 1 st July, 2019. Cabinet, having considered the reference and recommendations of both the Environment and Regeneration Scrutiny Committee and

(6) That Cabinet agrees for annual permits to be transferrable to other vehicles and sites.	the Corporate Performance and Resources Scrutiny Committee RESOLVED – THAT the reports be noted and fed into a comprehensive and indepth review of these matters. (Min. No. C25 refers) Completed
(7) That Cabinet be advised of the Committee's view that in relation to Barry Island off-street car parks, the charge of £1.00 for one hour be supplemented by two hours for £2.00, and for the charges in these car parks to remain seasonal.	
Country Parks –	
(8) That Cabinet agrees for annual permits to be transferrable to other vehicles and other sites.	Referred to Cabinet meeting on 1 st July, 2019. Cabinet, having considered the reference and recommendations of both the Environment and Regeneration Scrutiny Committee and the Corporate Performance and Resources Scrutiny Committee RESOLVED – THAT the reports be noted and fed into a comprehensive and indepth review of these matters. (Min. No. C25 refers) Completed
(9) That a further report be presented to the Committee that addresses the issues of displacement.	Added to work programme schedule. Completed
On-Street Parking –	
(10) That Cabinet be advised of the Committee's view for greater consideration to be given around the impact of displacement should on-street charging be adopted.	Referred to Cabinet meeting on 1 st July, 2019. Cabinet, having considered the reference and recommendations of both the Environment and Regeneration Scrutiny Committee and the Corporate Performance and Resources Scrutiny Committee RESOLVED – THAT the reports be noted and fed into a comprehensive and indepth review of these matters. (Min. No. C25 refers) Completed
(11) That Cabinet be advised of the Committee's view that on-street parking on Barry Island should be free for the first two hours and parking free during the winter period.	
Residents Parking Policy –	
(12) That in relation to Appendix 5 and the Resident Parking Policy, for Cabinet to agree the following amendments: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Paragraph 1.1 - Resident parking schemes are provided in streets <u>where the majority of residents have no alternative</u> 	Referred to Cabinet meeting on 1 st July, 2019. Cabinet, having considered the reference and recommendations of both the Environment and Regeneration Scrutiny Committee and the Corporate Performance and Resources Scrutiny Committee

<p>but to park their vehicles <u>on-street</u> and where the typical parking conditions throughout the week justify a level of assistance. Delete underlined</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Paragraph 2.1 - Requests for resident parking schemes will be assessed on the basis of parking conditions throughout a typical week. For a scheme to proceed, the average parking level observed must reach or exceed 75% of the available parking space. Add “on-street” after “75% of the” Paragraph 2.2 - If the initial evaluation suggests that the 75% criteria is likely to be reached, at least 2 further detailed surveys will be carried between out Monday to Saturday up to 6.00pm. Depending on specific circumstances and locations additional surveys may be undertaken as considered necessary to evaluate the parking availability. Replace “Saturday” with “Friday” 	<p>RESOLVED – THAT the reports be noted and fed into a comprehensive and indepth review of these matters. (Min. No. C25 refers) Completed</p>
<p>25 June 2019</p>	
<p>Min. No. 84 – Weltag Stage Two M4 To A48 Update (REF) – Recommended</p>	
<p>(1) That Cabinet give consideration to an additional option of improving the existing infrastructure without the need for a new road.</p>	<p>Cabinet, on 29th July, 2019, resolved [1] That in relation to recommendation (1) of the Environment and Regeneration Scrutiny Committee meeting 25th June, it be noted that the Welsh Government has included an additional option of improving the existing infrastructure without the need for a new road on the Stage Two Plus process. (Min. No. C53 refers) Completed</p>

(2) That an additional report on the Stage Two Plus process should be reported back to the Committee.	Added to work programme schedule. Completed
(3) That a letter be sent to the Welsh Government Minister in light of the Welsh Government declaration of a climate emergency, requesting the Welsh Government to outline its vision and how the impact on the environment would be minimised.	
(4) That Cabinet be requested to consider the impact on future generations and the environment should a new road be approved.	Cabinet, on 29 th July, 2019, resolved [2] That in relation to recommendation (4) of Environment and Regeneration Scrutiny Committee meeting 25 th June, it be noted that this will be covered in the Stage Two Plus process. (Min. No. C53 refers) Completed
Min. No. 85 – Vale of Glamorgan Toilet Strategy (REF) – Recommended	
(1) That Cabinet give further consideration to the possibility of introducing charging for the use of public toilets.	Cabinet, at its meeting on 29 th July, 2019, resolved (1) T H A T in relation to recommendation (1) of the Environment and Regeneration Scrutiny Committee meeting 25 th June the Scrutiny Committee's recommendation for charging for use of public toilets would be considered in conjunction with the possibility of the Welsh Government removing the National Non-Domestic Rates (NNDR) for these facilities as part of the consultation exercise. (2) T H A T in relation to recommendation (2) of the Environment and Regeneration Scrutiny Committee meeting 25 th June, the Council had already implemented public access to toilets at the Civic Office for a trial period. (3) T H A T in relation to recommendation (3) of the Environment and Regeneration Scrutiny Committee meeting 25 th June, the Council would continue to engage with local business in order to assist deliver its Toilet Strategy. (4) T H A T an update report be provided to the Cabinet and Scrutiny
(2) That Cabinet be asked to consider public access to toilets at the Civic Office, and also to look at how Reception staff inform the public that toilets are not currently available.	
(3) That Cabinet give further consideration around how Business' can be involved in assisting the Council to deliver the Strategy.	

	Committee outlining whether the strategy has been successful. (Min. No. C54 refers) Completed
(4) That an update report be provided to the Committee outlining whether the strategy has been successful.	Added to work programme schedule. Completed
Min. No. 86 – Cardiff Capital Region City Deal – Joint Scrutiny Committee Nominated Deputy (MD) – Recommended	
That the Scrutiny Committee recommends to Full Council that Councillor S. Sivagnanam be appointed as the nominated deputy to represent the Council on the Cardiff Capital Region City Deal - Joint Overview and Scrutiny Committee in the absence of the Chairman of the Environment and Regeneration Scrutiny Committee.	Full Council, on 29 th July, 2019, approved and endorsed the Scrutiny Committee's recommendation. (Min. No. 213 refers) Completed
Min. No. 87 – 4th Quarter Scrutiny Decision Tracking of Recommendations and Proposed Work Programme Schedule 2019/20 (MD) – Recommended	
(1) That the updated work programme schedule attached at Appendix E to the report be uploaded to the Council's website.	Work programme uploaded to the Council's website. Completed
17 May 2018	
Min. No. 46 – Development of Tourism and Commercial Opportunities at Countryside Service Sites – Call-In - Councillor L. Burnett – Recommended	
(3) That a Scrutiny Task and Finish Group be established to look at future proposals for Tourism and Commercial Opportunities at Countryside Service sites and that this recommendation be referred to the Scrutiny Chairman and Vice-Chairman Group for its consideration in line with Corporate Priorities..	The Scrutiny Committee Chairmen and Vice-Chairmen Group considered the progress of the Wales Audit Office Action Plan at its meeting on 24 th July, 2019 and Task and Finish work would be considered as part of that process. Completed
7 March 2019	
Min. No. 830 – Revenue and Capital Monitoring for the Period 1st April 2018 to 31st January 2019 (DEH) – Recommended	
(2) That a cost benefit analysis be undertaken on the conversion of standard lantern units to the installation of new LED lanterns or ornamental and bespoke street lighting units in residential areas.	Added to Work Programme. Completed

Reasons for recommendations

- (1) For information.

- (2) To maintain effective tracking of the Committee's recommendations.