

SUSTAINABLE SETTLEMENTS APPRAISAL

DECEMBER 2007



Vale of Glamorgan Local Development Plan 2011 - 2026

Sustainable Settlements Appraisal

1. INTRODUCTION

1.1 As part of the Local Development Plan (LDP) Draft Preferred Strategy stage, the Council has assessed which settlements are capable of accommodating additional sustainable development. The purpose of this study was to identify which settlements can provide for most of the everyday needs of local residents. The Council will ultimately need to allocate sufficient land in the LDP for housing, employment and other land uses in accordance with the Wales Spatial Plan and Planning Policy Wales (2002).

1.2 This study seeks to meet the following objectives:

Objective1: *To assess the need for residents to commute beyond their settlement to employment and retail facilities.*

Objective2: *To measure the accessibility of settlements by public transport.*

Objective3: *To measure the potential for a resident's everyday needs for services and facilities to be met within that settlement.*

2. CONTEXT

Policy

2.1 Planning Policy Wales (2002) states that “UDPs (LDPs) need to provide a framework to stimulate, guide and manage change towards sustainability.” “In their land allocation policies and proposals, local planning authorities should:

- Promote sustainable patterns of development, identifying previously developed land and buildings, and indicating locations for higher density development at hubs and interchanges and close to route corridors where accessibility on foot and by bicycle and public transport is good;
- Maintain and improve the vitality, attractiveness and viability of town, district, local and village centres;
- Foster development approaches that recognise the mutual dependence between town and country, thus improving linkages between urban areas and their rural surroundings.” (paragraph 2.5.2 refers)

2.2 In preparing LDPs, PPW advises Local Planning Authorities to assess the extent to which their settlement strategies are “consistent with minimising the need to travel and increasing accessibility by modes other than the private car. A broad balance between housing and employment opportunities should be promoted to minimise the need for long distance commuting. Local authorities should adopt policies to locate major generators of travel demand such as housing, employment, retailing, leisure and recreation, and community facilities including libraries, schools and hospitals within existing urban areas or in other locations which are, or can be, well served by public transport, or can be reached by walking or cycling. Preparing accessibility profiles for public transport, walking, cycling and freight may assist local authorities in plan preparation and assessing possible development sites. Wherever possible travel intensive developments should be located at major public transport nodes or interchanges. Higher density development, including residential development should be encouraged, near

public transport nodes, or near corridors well served by public transport (or with the potential to be so served).” (paragraph 2.5.3 refers)

- 2.3 Planning Policy Wales (2002) also stipulates that ‘In planning for housing in rural areas it is important to recognise that development in the countryside should embody sustainability principles, benefiting the rural economy and local communities while maintaining and enhancing the environment. There should be a choice of housing, recognising the housing needs of all, including those in need of affordable or special needs provision. In order to safeguard the character and appearance of the countryside, to reduce the need to travel by car and to economise on the provision of services, new houses in the countryside away from existing settlements recognised in UDPs, or from other areas allocated for development, must be strictly controlled. Many parts of the countryside have isolated groups of dwellings. Sensitive filling in of small gaps, or minor extensions to such groups, may be acceptable, but much depends upon the character of the surroundings, the pattern of development in the area and the accessibility to main towns and villages.’ (paragraph 9.2.18 refers)

Settlements within the Vale of Glamorgan

- 2.4 The Vale of Glamorgan is Wales' most southern Unitary Authority and covers 33097 hectares (331 square miles) with 53 kilometres of coastline, of which 19 kilometres is Heritage Coast. The rich mix of undulating farmland, valley basins; woodland and unspoilt coastline is a testimony to the richness and diversity of the natural environment of the Vale of Glamorgan. The population of the Vale was recorded as 119,292 in the 2001 Census, having grown steadily for many years.
- 2.5 The main settlements are Barry, Penarth, Dinas Powys, Llantwit Major and Cowbridge, the latter two being historic market towns that are surrounded by smaller rural settlements. Barry, the largest town with a population of 48,000, is the Vale's administrative centre, a seaside resort and port. Cardiff International Airport is located at Rhoose, 3 miles west of Barry.

3. PROCESS

Study Settlements

3.1 The settlements for this study were derived from a previous study undertaken in 2005 which sought to establish whether Council supported bus services were being selected in the most equitable and effective way. The analysis showed the Council's current bus service levels compared with the recommended levels in the Local Area Bus Strategy. This study builds on that original piece of work by including various criteria to determine the suitability of a particular settlement in relation to accommodating new development. The criteria deemed necessary for this assessment, were identified at various LDP stakeholder workshops and are detailed as follows:

- The presence of employment / retail opportunities;
- The presence and quality of existing public transport services;
- The range of services and facilities available.

3.2 A total of 96 settlements were identified within the Vale of Glamorgan for assessment in the sustainable settlement study. (Appendix 1)

3.3 The population figures quoted have been taken from an average household count based on the assumption that each household comprises of 2.4 people. Any households lying outside the settlements were not considered; therefore there may be some discrepancy with the household average and the 2001 Census figures. Plan A in Appendix 2 shows the parameters of each settlement examined in the study.

3.4 It should be noted that the figures in the 2001 Census were not used as they were not broken down in the same way as this study. In undertaking the assessment, it was evident that many of the settlements identified shared access to facilities in nearby settlements and were therefore effectively part of larger settlements. These smaller, sub areas of main settlements, were therefore rationalised with the larger settlements as shown below:

<i>Common name used for further analysis purposes</i>	<i>Individual settlements considered suitable for integration</i>
St Athan	Eglwys Brewis / Picketston / RAF East Camp / RAF West Camp / St Athan
Cowbridge	Cowbridge / Llanblethian
Sully	Cog / Sully
Rhoose	Fontygary / Rhoose
Llantwit Major	Boverton / Llantwit Major
Barry	Barry / The Bendricks
Bonvilston	Bonvilston / Greenway

Sustainability Criteria

3.5 To identify which settlements might be appropriate for the purpose of accommodating new development, each one was assessed against a number of sustainability criteria. For this study, the individual criteria were based on key services that contribute towards meeting the daily needs of the population and reduce reliance to travel to access facilities and services. Each of the settlements were assessed against the criteria and then ranked depending on their performance. They were then added together to calculate a settlement's position for each criterion. This provided their 'Overall Assessment'.

The following table 1 shows the selection criteria used for this study:

Table 1

<i>Criteria</i>	<i>Indicators</i>	<i>Weighting</i>
Social considerations	Population	Zero weighted but used to identify ranges of settlements.
Retail Services / Employment	General Store / Post Office / Employment Area e.g. power station, garden centres, R.A.F. base	Considered of highest importance to reduce the number of journeys, as these are basic every day essential needs and therefore triple scored. *
Transport Services and Accessibility	Bus / Rail	Seen as very important to reduce the number of trips made by single car occupancy, therefore public transport was double rated. **
Community Services and Facilities	Preferable and Desirable Services and Facilities e.g. schools, restaurants, play areas etc	Each of the other community services and facilities were given a single score each. ***

***Retail / Employment Services – Core Services**

Objective: To assess the need for residents to commute beyond their settlement to employment and retail facilities.

- 3.6 The availability of employment opportunities locally can contribute towards delivering sustainable communities. It can assist significantly in sustaining, enhancing and revitalising rural settlements. It also provides the opportunity to have an important daily activity and generator of trips provided locally, thereby reducing the need to travel by the private car. Local employment opportunities are a positive indicator of suitable sustainable settlements. Whilst there is no certainty that these local employment opportunities are taken up by local residents, it is nevertheless important that these opportunities exist.
- 3.7 Likewise the same principle applies where there is a general store or a post office. Providing these locally can enhance community spirit and reduce the number of trips made by car. Again there is no guarantee that the residents will utilise these local facilities, but still the opportunities exist. These three services taken together have been identified as 'Core Services'. Each settlement that contained these services was given a score of 1 for each individual service and those that did not have any were given a zero score. Therefore the maximum scoring for these criteria was 3 and the minimum was zero. The Core Services were then weighted and the scores tripled to weight them three times higher than the other service areas, given the relevance and importance of these services.

****Transport Services and Accessibility**

Objective: To measure the accessibility of settlements by public transport.

- 3.8 It is important that a settlement suitable for development has good accessibility to services and facilities, both to those within the towns/villages and those close by, thereby helping communities to meet many of their everyday needs. Good access to services and facilities, including public transport, gives choice to the user and can reduce the reliance on private cars for

travel. It also allows more social inclusion for the young and others who cannot drive or afford a car. Whilst walking and cycling are both highly sustainable modes of travel, they were not included in this study.

3.9 The public transport provision of each settlement was considered and any area that has in excess of an hourly service was given a scoring of 1, those that are serviced between hourly and two hourly a scoring of 0.66, those that are serviced less than that a scoring of 0.33. Those that are not serviced did not score (0). This process was undertaken for week day services, evening services, Saturday day services, Saturday evening services, Sunday day services and Sunday evening services. The scores were then totalled and doubled to give a double weighting to the transport element.

*****Community Services and Facilities**

Objective: To measure the potential for a settlement's everyday needs for services and facilities to be met within that settlement.

3.10 A sustainable settlement needs to offer the community a reasonable range of services and facilities. This objective will help to concentrate any limited new development to areas that are well-serviced.

3.11 There appears to be no definitive grouping that concisely defines those services and facilities needed to provide for these everyday needs. Accordingly, for the purposes of this exercise, the Council has grouped the services and facilities necessary to enable a settlement to function as a sustainable settlement, to include those considered with most benefit for the community, as well as leisure services and facilities that are 'desirable' in meeting the everyday needs of residents.

3.12 This broad division will help to distinguish between those settlements which offer a range of services and facilities more suited to meeting the day to day needs of the local community and those having limited services and facilities. The relevant services and facilities considered were as follows:-

- *Surgery*
- *Post Box*
- *Public House*
- *Place of Worship*
- *Community Hall*
- *Restaurant / Takeaway*
- *Primary School*
- *Secondary School*
- *Nursery*
- *Doctor*
- *Dentist*
- *Outside Play Area*
- *Formal Sports Pitch*
- *Leisure Centre*

3.13 The data used in the assessment of settlements comes from an audit of services and facilities undertaken during spring 2007. This was based on a desk top study using the Council's Geographical Information System, aerial photographs, the internet as well as site visits to each location to confirm the existence of such facilities.

3.14 A score of 1 has been attributed to the presence of a service/facility in a settlement and a score of 0 for its absence. The settlements have been ordered by the total sum of the services and facilities.

4. OUTCOMES

4.1 The table 2 below shows each of the Study Group Settlements and their scores ranked according to the services and facilities available in that settlement. A more detailed table can be found in Appendix 3.

Table 2

Area Settlement	Total	Area Settlement	Total	Area Settlement	Total	Area Settlement	Total	Area Settlement	Total
Barry	37	St Nicholas	14	Llysworney	9	Maendy	5	Llandough (Cowbridge)	2
Penarth	37	Llanmaes	13	Llangan	9	Moulton	5	Llampha	1
Llantwit Major	35	Leckwith	13	Aberthin	9	Llantrithyd	4	Lavernock	1
Rhoose	35	Southerndown	13	Llancafarn	8	Porthkerry	4	St Lythans	1
Cowbridge	33	Tredogan	13	Fferm Goch	8	Flemingston	4	Llansannor	1
Dinas Powys	33	Peterston-super-Ely	13	Sigingstone	8	St Georges	4	Drope	1
Sully	28	Colwinston	12	St Mary Church	8	St Mary Hill	3	Dyffryn	1
Llandough (Penarth)	28	Marcross	12	Penllyn	7	Swanbridge	3	Castle-upon-Alun	1
St Athan	27	Llandow	11	Hensol	7	St Andrews Major	3	Penn Onn	0
Wenvoe	26	Pendoylan	11	St Brides-super-Ely	7	Llanbethery	3	Norton	0
St Brides Major	25	Treoes	11	St Hilary	7	Michaelston le Pit	3	St y Nyll	0
Wick	22	Ystradowen	11	The Herberts	7	Pancross	3	Walterston	0
Bonvilston	21	Monknash	11	Graig Penllyn	7	Tair Onen	3	Llanmihangel	0
Ewenny	20	The Downs	11	Gwern y Steeple	5	Twyn yr Odyn	3	West Aberthaw	0
Aberthaw (East)	19	St Donats	11	Llancadle	5	Trerhyngyll	2		
Ogmore by Sea	19	Ogmore Village	10	Welsh St Donats	5	Tre-Dodridge	2		
Corntown	17	Penmark	10	City	5	Ruthin	2		
Pentre Meyrick	14	Broughton	10	Fonmon	5	Gileston	2		

5. CONCLUSIONS

5.1 The findings of the study clearly show that there is a hierarchy of settlements within the Vale. These range from urban town centres and historic market towns that are fully integrated as a result of the benefit from a wide range of services and facilities, and reasonable public transport access, to rural settlements with some facilities and limited public transport access, to small hamlets and isolated properties with minimal, or no community services and facilities or public transport access.

5.2 It is evident that all town centres and areas with a population of more than 1000, (listed below), benefit from a range of services and facilities more suited to meeting the day to day needs of the local community and can therefore sustain additional growth in the LDP.

- Barry
- Llantwit Major
- Cowbridge
- Sully
- St Athan
- Penarth
- Rhoose
- Dinas Powys
- Llandough (Penarth)
- Wenvoe

5.3 In accordance with Planning Policy Wales (2002), in order to provide a choice of housing, whilst still safeguarding the character and appearance of the countryside, a small number of settlements, that have a reasonable number of community facilities and transport services, have been identified as capable of accommodating some additional growth . However, any new development would only be of benefit through the imposition of planning obligations to promote improvements in existing facilities, the provision of new community facilities and improvements to accessibility with a particular emphasis on public transport. They are generally the larger populated rural areas (as listed below) that have sufficient population to sustain the additional services and facilities required for them to grow.

- St Brides Major
- Wick
- Ewenny
- Ogmore by Sea
- Southerndown
- Ystradowen
- Bonvilston
- Corntown

5.4 There is another category of isolated groups of dwellings in the countryside where sensitive infilling of small gaps, or minor extensions to such groups, may be acceptable. Many of them include a primary school and a public house among the dwellings or other comparable services that make them more appealing in terms of sustainability, although further consideration of these areas would need to include a strategic environmental assessment.

- Aberthaw (East)
- Colwinston
- Aberthin
- St Nicholas
- Pendoylan
- Treoes
- Llysworney
- Llancarfan
- Llanmaes
- Peterston super Ely
- Sigingstone
- Penllyn
- Llandow

5.5 The following are settlements whose key attraction is their rurality. Whilst some may have scored highly due to their proximity to the strategic road network or the fact that they have a daily bus service (albeit infrequent) they have very little in the way of community facilities or services. Therefore they are not considered to be suitable for additional development.

- Ogmore Village
- Penmark
- Broughton
- The Herberts
- Hensol
- Pentre Meyrick
- Monknash
- Llangan
- Fferm Goch
- St Brides-super-Ely
- The Downs
- St Donats
- Marcross
- St Mary Church
- St Hilary
- Graig Penllyn
- Gwern y Steeple
- Llancadle
- Welsh St Donats
- City
- Leckwith
- Tredogan
- Maendy
- Moulton
- Fonmon

5.6 In order to conclude what is deemed suitable for future development in the way of sustainability, it is envisaged that many rural settlements cannot realistically fulfil this role principally because they do not have the range of services and facilities necessary to meet this requirement. Many of them are small hamlets or isolated houses/farm houses or barn conversions with no access to public transport services, basic community services or employment opportunities. Some scored a single point on the basis that they had a post box, a place of worship, a pub or restaurant etc, but no more than that. These hamlets are still very important as they contribute to the character of the rural Vale and require protection from over-development through planning controls that safeguard their environment. It is reasonable to conclude that due to the high reliance on the private car to access basic amenities; these areas are unsustainable and are unsuitable for further development. The areas identified are as follows:

- Llantrithyd
- Porthkerry
- Flemingston
- St Georges
- St Mary Hill
- St Andrews Major
- Llanbethery
- Michaelston le Pit
- Pancross
- Tair Onen
- Trerhyngyll
- Tre-Dodridge
- Ruthin
- Gileston
- Llandough (Cow)
- Lavernock
- St Lythans
- Llansannor
- Drope
- Dyffryn
- Penn Onn
- Norton
- St Y Nyll
- Walterston
- Llanmihangel
- Swanbridge
- Twyn yr Odyn
- Llampha
- Castle-upon-Alun
- West Aberthaw

Appendix 1 – Settlements identified within the Vale of Glamorgan for assessment in the sustainable settlements study.

The population figures quoted have been taken from an average household count based on the assumption that each household comprises of 2.4 people.

Table 3 - Study Group Settlements and Population								
Aberthaw (East)	-	101	Drope	-	73	Leckwith	-	26
Aberthaw (West)	-	103	Dyffryn	-	34	Llanbethery	-	67
Aberthin	-	139	Eglwys Brewis	-	653	Llanblethian	-	509
Barry	-	47653	Ewenny	-	269	Llancadle	-	50
Bendricks	-	167	Fferm Goch	-	108	Llancarfan	-	163
Bonvilston	-	293	Flemingston	-	86	Llandough (Cowbridge)	-	62
Boverton	-	1219	Fonmon	-	55	Llandough (Penarth)	-	1990
Broughton	-	118	Fontygary	-	1481	Llandow	-	185
Castle-upon-Alun	-	29	Gileston	-	67	Llangan	-	48
City	-	29	Graig Penllyn	-	300	Llanmaes	-	312
Cog	-	299	Greenway	-	46	Llanmihangel	-	12
Colwinston	-	187	Gwern Y Steeple	-	72	Llansannor	-	38
Corntown	-	194	Hensol	-	48	Llantrithyd	-	74
Cowbridge	-	3500	Llampha	-	7	Llantwit Major	-	7744
Dinas Powys	-	7262	Lavernock	-	48	Llysworney	-	170

Study Group Settlements and Population							
Maendy	-	36	Porthkerry	-	55	St Nicholas	- 185
Marcross	-	101	RAF East Camp	-	600	St y Nyll	- 17
Michaelston-le-Pit	-	79	RAF West Camp	-	600	Sully	- 2879
Monknash	-	10	Rhoose	-	2122	Swanbridge	- 41
Moulton	-	24	Ruthin	-	22	Tair Onen	- 67
Norton	-	7	Sigingstone	-	91	The Downs	- 115
Ogmore-by-Sea	-	910	Southerndown	-	161	The Herberts	- 84
Ogmore Village	-	40	St Andrews Major	-	34	Tre-Dodridge	- 31
Pancross	-	41	St Athan	-	1296	Tredogan	- 2
Penarth	-	20396	St Brides Major	-	610	Trerhyngyll	- 86
Pendoylan	-	50	St Brides-Super-Ely	-	70	Treoes	- 355
Penllyn	-	127	St Donats	-	43	Twyn-yr-Odyn	- 67
Penmark	-	125	St Georges	-	55	Walterston	- 36
Penn Onn	-	26	St Hilary	-	110	Welsh St Donats	- 192
Pentre Meyrick	-	34	St Lythans	-	43	Wenvoe	- 1080
Peterston-super-Ely	-	276	St Mary Church	-	58	Wick	- 434
Picketston	-	24	St Mary Hill	-	46	Ystradowen	- 420
Total: 96 Settlements							

Appendix 2

Vale of Glamorgan Settlements Considered for Sustainable Settlement Study



Appendix 3 - Study Group Settlements ranked according to the services and facilities available in that settlement.

Table 4

Area Settlement	Community & Employment	Transport Services & Accessibility	Community Facilities	Overall Total	Weighted
Barry	3	7	14	24	37
Penarth	3	7	14	24	37
Rhose	3	7	14	24	37
Llantwit Major	3	6	14	23	35
St Athan	3	6	14	23	35
Sully	3	6	14	23	35
Dinas Powys	2	7	14	23	34
Cowbridge	3	5	14	22	33
Bonvilston	3	5	13	21	32
Llandough (Penarth)	2	6	12	20	30
Wenvoe	2	6	10	18	28
St Brides Major	2	5	11	18	27
Wick	2	4	10	16	24
Ewenny	2	5	6	13	22
Ogmore by Sea	2	4	7	13	21
Aberthaw (East)	1	6	5	12	20

Area Settlement	Community & Employment	Transport Services & Accessibility	Community Facilities	Overall Total	Weighted
Corntown	2	2	9	13	19
Pentre Meyrick	1	5	2	8	15
Llanmaes	1	2	7	10	14
Monknash	0	4	6	10	14
St Nicholas	0	5	4	9	14
Leckwith	0	5	3	8	13
Peterston super Ely	0	2	9	11	13
Southerndown	0	4	5	9	13
Tredogan	0	6	1	7	13
Colwinston	0	2	8	10	12
Llandow	1	2	5	8	12
Marcross	0	4	4	8	12
Treoes	1	1	7	9	12
Ystradowen	1	1	7	9	12
Pendoylan	0	2	7	9	11
Penmark	1	1	6	8	11
St Donats	0	4	3	7	11
The Downs	0	5	1	6	11
Broughton	0	4	2	6	10

Area Settlement	Community & Employment	Transport Services & Accessibility	Community Facilities	Overall Total	Weighted
Llangan	1	1	5	7	10
Ogmore Village	0	4	2	6	10
Aberthin	0	2	5	7	9
Fferm Goch	1	1	4	6	9
Llysworney	0	2	5	7	9
Sigingstone	0	2	4	6	8
St Mary Church	0	2	4	6	8
Graig Penllyn	0	1	5	6	7
Hensol	0	3	1	4	7
Llancarfan	0	1	5	6	7
Penllyn	0	1	5	6	7
St Brides-super-Ely	0	2	3	5	7
St Hilary	0	1	5	6	7
The Herberts	0	2	3	5	7
City	0	1	3	4	5
Gwern y Steeple	0	2	1	3	5
Llancadle	0	1	3	4	5
Maendy	0	2	1	3	5
Moulton	0	1	3	4	5

Area Settlement	Community & Employment	Transport Services & Accessibility	Community Facilities	Overall Total	Weighted
St Andrews Major	0	1	3	4	5
Welsh St Donats	0	1	3	4	5
Fonmon	0	1	3	4	5
Flemingston	0	1	2	3	4
Llantrithyd	0	1	2	3	4
Porthkerry	0	0	4	4	4
St Georges	0	0	4	4	4
Llanbethery	0	1	1	2	3
Michaelston le Pit	0	0	3	3	3
Pancross	0	1	1	2	3
St Mary Hill	0	1	1	2	3
Tair Onen	0	1	1	2	3
Twyn yr Odyn	0	0	3	3	3
Swanbridge	0	0	3	3	3
Gileston	0	0	2	2	2
Ruthin	0	1	0	1	2
Tre-Dodridge	0	1	0	1	2
Trerhyngyll	0	0	2	2	2
Llandough (Cowbridge)	0	0	2	2	2

Area Settlement	Community & Employment	Transport Services & Accessibility	Community Facilities	Overall Total	Weighted
Castle Upon Alun	0	0	1	1	1
Drope	0	0	1	1	1
Dyffryn	0	0	1	1	1
Llampha	0	0	1	1	1
Llansannor	0	0	1	1	1
St Lythans	0	0	1	1	1
Lavernock	0	0	1	1	1
Aberthaw (West)	0	0	0	0	0
Llanmihangel	0	0	0	0	0
Norton	0	0	0	0	0
Penn Onn	0	0	0	0	0
St y Nyll	0	0	0	0	0
Walterston	0	0	0	0	0

The Vale of Glamorgan Council
Directorate of Environmental & Economic Regeneration

Dock Office

Barry Docks

Barry CF63 4RT

LDP@valeofglamorgan.gov.uk

www.valeofglamorgan.gov.uk

